



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/683,681	10/14/2003	Linda S. Terrell	7671	1818
31253	7590	04/22/2004	EXAMINER	
M. REID RUSSELL 854 WEST 3390 SOUTH HURRICANE, UT 84737			VALENTI, ANDREA M	
		ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER	
		3643		

DATE MAILED: 04/22/2004

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Office Action Summary	Application No.	Applicant(s)	
	10/683,681	TERRELL, LINDA S.	
	Examiner Andrea M. Valenti	Art Unit 3643	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

1) Responsive to communication(s) filed on 14 October 2003.

2a) This action is **FINAL**. 2b) This action is non-final.

3) Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims.

4) Claim(s) 1-5 is/are pending in the application.

4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.

5) Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.

6) Claim(s) 1-5 is/are rejected.

7) Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.

8) Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

9) The specification is objected to by the Examiner.

10) The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) accepted or b) objected to by the Examiner.
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).

11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).

a) All b) Some * c) None of:
 1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

1) Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
 2) Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
 3) Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08)
 Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____

4) Interview Summary (PTO-413)
 Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____

5) Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
 6) Other: _____

DETAILED ACTION

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102

The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless –

(b) the invention was patented or described in a printed publication in this or a foreign country or in public use or on sale in this country, more than one year prior to the date of application for patent in the United States.

Claims 1, 4, and 5 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by U.S. Patent No. 4,124,953 to Patton.

Regarding Claim 1, Patton teaches a container garden with a container (#12) having a bottom and upstanding side wall and arranged to receive a lid (#20) fitted thereover; a sack (#30 and Col. 2 line 67-68) formed from a mesh material to receive a growth medium and selected seed (#34) mixture and be closed at its end into a pouch for fitting in the container.

Regarding Claim 4, Patton teaches the seeds are wheat, barley, oats, rye and catnip (Col. 1 line 25).

Regarding Claim 5, Patton teaches the container and lid are each formed from a plastic material (Col. 2 line 47-51).

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negatived by the manner in which the invention was made.

Claim 2 is rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over U.S. Patent No. 4,124,953 to Patton in view of U.S. Patent No. 3,375,607 to Melvold.

Regarding Claim 2, Patton teaches a sack (Patton #30 and Col. 2 line 67-68), but is silent on the sack is formed from a nylon stocking material and is closed at one end. However, Melvold teaches a nylon sack closed at one ^{end} (Melvold Col. 2 line 22). It would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art to modify the teachings of Patton with the teachings of Melvold at the time of the invention since the modification is merely the selection of a known material for intended use to meet certain design parameters such as manufacturing costs and does not present a patentably distinguishable limitation.

Claim 3 is rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over U.S. Patent No. 4,124,953 to Patton

Regarding Claim 3, Patton teaches vermiculite and potting soil (Patton Col. 2 line 12 and line 61), but is silent on the growth medium is a mixture of one part potting soil and three parts vermiculite. However, it would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art to modify the teachings at the time of the invention since the modification is merely the selection of the component ratios of the known materials, the ratios merely derived through routine laboratory tests and experimentation to meet the growing needs of each seed variety.

Conclusion

The prior art made of record and not relied upon is considered pertinent to applicant's disclosure.

European Patent EP 0609510 A1; U.S. Patent No. 3,961,444; U.S. Patent No. 2,720,725; U.S. Patent Pub. 2003/0079403A1; U.S. Patent No. 5,806,242; U.S. Patent No. 5,103,584; U.S. Patent No. 4,790,105; U.S. Patent No. 5,421,123; U.S. Patent No. 5,127,187; U.S. Patent No. 5,054,234; U.S. Patent No. 5,375,371; U.S. Patent No. 6,643,978; U.S. Patent No. 5,194,030; U.S. Patent No. 5,555,675; and U.S. Patent No. 5,852,896.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Andrea M. Valenti whose telephone number is 703-305-3010. The examiner can normally be reached on 7:30am-5pm M-F; Alternating Fridays Off.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Peter M. Poon can be reached on 703-308-2574. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703-872-9306.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only.

For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>.
Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the
Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

Andrea M. Valenti
Andrea M. Valenti
Examiner
Art Unit 3643

24 March 2004

Robert P. Swiatek
ROBERT P. SWIATEK
PRIMARY EXAMINER
ART UNIT 3643

Peter M. Poon
Supervisory Patent Examiner
Technology Center 3600